



Public Policy Institute for Wales
Sefydliad Polisi Cyhoeddus i Gymru

Supporting progression in growth sectors – Technical Annex

October 2016

Supporting progression in growth sectors: A review of the international evidence – Technical Annex

Dr Paul Sissons, Professor Anne Green and Dr Neil Lee

Centre for Business in Society, Coventry University;
Institute for Employment Research, University of Warwick;
Geography and Environment, London School of Economics and
Political Science

This report and the information contained within it are the copyright of the Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO, and are licensed under the terms of the Open Government Licence <http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>. The views expressed are the author's and do not necessarily reflect those of members of the Institute's Executive Group or Board of Governors. The report is one of a series of outputs from Economic and Social Research Council, grant reference ES/M007111/1 – 'Harnessing Growth Sectors for Poverty Reduction: What Works to Reduce Poverty through Sustainable Employment with Opportunities for Progression'.

For further information please contact:

Emyr Williams

Public Policy Institute for Wales

Tel: 029 2087 5345

Email: Emyr.Williams@ppiw.org.uk

Table A5: Findings from evaluations of sector-focused programmes from Maguire et al (2010)

	All sample			WRTP			JVS-Boston			Per Scholas		
	Treatment impact	Control Group Mean	Treatment Group mean	Treatment impact	Control Group Mean	Treatment Group mean	Treatment impact	Control Group Mean	Treatment Group mean	Treatment impact	Control Group Mean	Treatment Group mean
Earnings												
Total Earnings, 24 Months	\$4,509***	\$24,425	\$28,934	\$6,255***	\$26,289	\$32,544	\$4,339**	\$20,186	\$24,525	\$3,827	\$25,992	\$29,819
Total Earnings, Months 13–24	\$4,011***	\$13,662	\$17,673	\$3,735***	\$13,614	\$17,349	\$4,237***	\$12,098	\$16,335	\$4,663***	\$14,680	\$19,34
Ever Employed												
Ever Employed, 24 Months	5%**	83%	88%	2%	92%	94%	10%**	78%	88%	5%	77%	83%
Ever Employed, Months 13–24	5%**	79%	84%	2%	88%	90%	10%**	72%	82%	9%*	73%	81%
Months Employed												
Months Employed, 24 Months	1.3***	13.6	14.9	1.1	15.9	17.0	1.6	12.3	13.8	1.6*	12.5	14.1
Months Employed, Months 13–24	1.3***	7.3	8.6	0.9*	8.1	9.0	1.9***	6.8	8.7	1.4**	6.9	8.3
Hours Worked												
Total Hours Worked, 24 Months	245**	2,089	2,334	241	2,548	2,789	298*	1,704	2,003	225	2,003	2,228
Total Hours Worked, Months 13–24	250***	1,130	1,380	191*	1,293	1,484	335***	980	1,315	249**	1,098	1,347
Hourly Wage—\$11 or More												
Months Working a Job Paying \$11 an Hour, 24 Months	2.0***	6.6	8.6	2.2**	6.5	8.7	2.2**	6.1	8.4	2.1**	6.9	9.0
Months Working a Job Paying \$11 an Hour, Months 13–24	1.5***	3.9	5.4	1.0**	3.5	4.5	1.6***	4.0	5.6	1.9***	4.0	5.9



Continued.

	All sample			WRTP			JVS-Boston			Per Scholas		
	Treatment impact	Control Group Mean	Treatment Group mean	Treatment impact	Control Group Mean	Treatment Group mean	Treatment impact	Control Group Mean	Treatment Group mean	Treatment impact	Control Group Mean	Treatment Group mean
Ever Worked a Job Paying \$11 an Hour, 24 Months	14%***	45%	59%	18%***	39%	57%	12%**	47%	59%	11%**	49%	60%
Ever Worked a Job Paying \$11 an Hour, Months 13–24	13%***	42%	55%	14%**	38%	52%	12%*	43%	55%	14%***	46%	60%
Hourly Wage—\$13 or More												
Months Working a Job Paying \$13 an Hour, 24 Months	1.2***	3.8	5.0	1.4*	3.6	5.0	0.7	3.3	4.0	1.6*	4.5	6.1
Months Working a Job Paying \$13 an Hour, Months 13–24	0.9***	2.3	3.2	0.7*	2.0	2.7	0.6	2.2	2.7	1.4***	2.7	4.1
Ever Worked a Job Paying \$13 an Hour, 24 Months	8%**	29%	37%	14%**	23%	37%	2%	27%	29%	7%*	37%	44%
Ever Worked a Job Paying \$13 an Hour, Months 13–24	8%***	26%	34%	11%*	22%	33%	3%	24%	27%	10%**	33%	43%

Source: Maguire et al (2010).

Notes: Statistical significance levels are: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent



Table A6: Employment outcomes from the Sector-Focused Career Centers

Outcome	All Sector-Focused Career Centers	Matched WF1CCs	Difference (Program Effect)	Percentage Change
Employment (%)				
Any employment in year after exit	82.5	73.3	9.2***	12.5
1 quarter after exit	66.1	52.9	13.2***	25
2 quarters after exit	67.1	54.9	12.2***	22.2
3 quarters after exit	66.8	54.9	11.9***	21.7
4 quarters after exit	66.4	55.7	10.7***	19.2
Quarters worked after exit (%)				
0 quarters	17.6	26.7	-9.2***	-34.4
1 quarter	9.3	12.1	-2.7***	-22.5
2 quarters	10.4	11.3	-0.9	-8.2
3 quarters	13.4	13.6	-0.3	-2.1
4 quarters	48.4	34.8	13.6***	39.1
Industry of employment (%)				
Employment in sector	62	39.9	22.1***	55.4
Number of participants	13,102	13,102		

Source: Gasper and Henderson (2014).

Notes: Statistical significance levels are: *** = 0.1 percent; ** = 1 percent; * = 5 percent



Table A7: Earnings outcomes from the Sector-Focused Career Centers

Outcome	All Sector-Focused Career Centers	Matched WF1CCs	Difference (Program Effect)	Percentage Change
Average quarterly earnings (\$)				
Unconditional				
Total year after exit	16,840	11,040	5,800***	52.5
1 quarter after exit	3,693	2,340	1,353***	57.8
2 quarters after exit	4,178	2,720	1,458***	53.6
3 quarters after exit	4,407	2,920	1,486***	50.9
4 quarters after exit	4,563	3,061	1,502***	49.1
Conditional on employment				
Total year after exit	20,133	15,130	5,003***	33.1
1 quarter after exit	5,395	4,356	1,039***	23.9
2 quarters after exit	6,054	4,876	1,179***	24.2
3 quarters after exit	6,426	5,253	1,173***	22.3
4 quarters after exit	6,705	5,404	1,300***	24.1
Number of participants	13,102	13,102		

Source: Gasper and Henderson (2014).

Notes: Statistical significance levels are: *** = 0.1 percent; ** = 1 percent; * = 5 percent



Table A8: Results for employment by Sector Focused Career Center sector

	Programme effect (% difference for employment)		
	Transportation	Manufacturing	Healthcare
Employment			
Any employment in year after exit	9.9***	8.7***	7.3***
1 quarter after exit	15.2***	11.9***	6.4***
2 quarters after exit	13.4***	10.8***	10.7***
3 quarters after exit	12.2***	8.0***	11.4***
4 quarters after exit	10.1***	8.6***	11.3***
Quarters worked after exit			
0	***-9.9	***-8.7	***-7.3
1	***-2.7	0.1	***-2.7
2	-0.7	-1.2	-1.4
3	-0.7	-1.8	2.4***
4	14.5***	11.8***	10.0***
Number of participants	8,589	1,638	2,862

Source: Gasper and Henderson (2014).

Notes: Notes: Statistical significance levels are: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent



Table A9: Results for earnings by Sector Focused Career Center sector

	Programme effect (\$ difference for earnings)		
	Transportation	Manufacturing	Healthcare
Earnings difference (\$) Average Quarterly earnings: Unconditional - total year after exit	5,114***	5,521***	7,381***
Earnings difference (\$) Average Quarterly earnings Conditional on employment - total year after exit	4,260***	5,052***	6,618***
Number of participants	8,589	1,638	2,862

Source: Gasper and Henderson (2014).

Notes: Notes: Statistical significance levels are: *** = 0.1 percent; ** = 1 percent; * = 5 percent



Table A10: WorkAdvance results by provider, from Year 2 WorkAdvance survey

Outcome (%)	Per Scholas			St. Nicks Alliance			Madison Strategies Group			Towards Employment		
	WA	C	Difference (Impact)	WA	C	Difference (Impact)	WA	C	Difference (Impact)	WA	C	Difference (Impact)
All jobs												
Ever employed	94.5	90.1	4.4*	90.0	90.8	-0.8	96.1	94.6	1.5	89.2	87.5	1.7
Currently employed	74.4	64.4	10.0***	65.3	65.4	-0.1	77.6	72.0	5.6	64.5	58.2	6.3
Percentage of months employed	57.0	53.2	3.8	53.7	52.7	0.9	65.7	67.6	-2.0	52.5	57.5	-5.0*
Current or most recent job												
Employed in targeted sector	61.1	20.4	40.7***	31.8	19.9	11.9***	64.6	48.2	16.5***	50.1	33.6	16.4***
Earnings												
Average total earnings per week (\$)	561	463	98***	520	504	16	551	525	27	379	360	19
Average hourly wage (\$)	15.23	12.85	2.38***	13.07	13.34	-0.27	12.47	12.01	0.46	10.11	9.78	0.33
Employed and hourly wage above \$12	63.1	46.8	16.3***	53.3	50.9	2.4	53.2	41.9	11.2***	28.5	27.7	1.8
Employed and hourly wage above \$15	46.0	29.8	16.2***	27.7	26.9	0.8	23.6	17.0	6.6*	8.7	11.5	-2.8
Hours												
Average hours worked per week	34.3	33.2	1.1	36.0	34.1	1.9	42.0	40.5	1.4	33.1	31.6	1.5
Sample size	287	265		205	179		297	263		286	276	

Source: Calculations from responses to WorkAdvance Year 2 Survey reported in Hendra et al (2016)

Notes: WA = WorkAdvance group; C = control group.

Statistical significance levels are: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent



Table A11. WorkAdvance results by provider quarters 2-10, from unemployment insurance administrative records

Outcome	Per Scholas			St. Nicks Alliance			Madison Strategies Group			Towards Employment		
	WA	C	Difference (Impact)	WA	C	Difference (Impact)	WA	C	Difference (Impact)	WA	C	Difference (Impact)
Quarters 2-10												
Ever employed (%)	89.0	86.1	2.9	87.6	83.5	4.1	92.8	92.8	0.0	92.5	86.6	5.9***
Average quarterly employment (%)	61.5	57.4	4.2*	56.7	55.2	1.5	69.9	67.5	2.4	65.3	62.2	3.1
Earnings (\$)	32,470	27,284	5,186**	27,782	27,982	-201	33,759	31,207	2,552	26,036	24,227	1,809
Year 1 (Quarters 2-5)												
Ever employed (%)	77.1	71.0	6.1*	78.2	70.4	7.7**	89.3	86.5	2.8	83.6	78.8	4.8*
Average quarterly employment (%)	53.3	51.1	2.2	52.8	50.6	2.2	72.6	68.8	3.8	61.9	61.4	0.5
Employed in all 4 quarters (%)	24.5	28.0	-3.5	20.8	27.7	-6.9*	50.1	48.8	1.3	38.1	42.4	-4.3
Earnings (\$)	8,868	8,718	150	9,395	9,648	-253	13,261	12,933	328	9,495	9,483	12
Earned \$20,000 or more (\$)	13.2	13.5	-0.3	13.7	17.7	-4.0	26.2	23.4	2.8	14.2	17.0	-2.8
Year 2 (Quarters 6-9)												
Ever employed (%)	82.4	76.4	6.0**	74.3	72.2	2.1	80.3	82.8	-2.5	79.1	73.7	5.4*
Average quarterly employment (%)	67.5	61.8	5.7*	59.8	57.8	2.0	68.4	67.6	0.8	67.6	62.5	5.1*
Employed in all 4 quarters (%)	50.4	43.4	7.0*	44.7	39.2	5.5	55.3	52.5	2.8	53.0	48.1	4.9
Earnings (\$)	18,217	14,471	3,747***	14,420	14,229	191	16,641	14,804	1,837*	13,223	11,602	1,621*
Earned \$20,000 or more (\$)	37.8	29.3	8.5**	32.2	27.4	4.8	40.5	31.1	9.4***	28.0	22.5	5.5*
Quarter 10												
Ever employed (%)	70.4	64.3	6.0*	60.4	63.3	-2.9	64.8	61.7	3.1	68.9	64.0	4.9
Earnings (\$)	5,385	4,096	1,289***	3,966	4,105	-139	3,857	3,470	387	3,318	3,142	176
Sample size	349	341		242	237		353	344		349	349	

Source: Calculations from unemployment insurance administrative records in Hendra et al (2016)

Notes: WA = WorkAdvance group; C = control group.

Statistical significance levels are: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent



The Public Policy Institute for Wales

The Public Policy Institute for Wales improves policy making and delivery by commissioning and promoting the use of independent expert analysis and advice. The Institute is independent of government but works closely with policy makers to help develop fresh thinking about how to address strategic challenges and complex policy issues. It:

- Works directly with Welsh Ministers to identify the evidence they need;
- Signposts relevant research and commissions policy experts to provide additional analysis and advice where there are evidence gaps;
- Provides a strong link between What Works Centres and policy makers in Wales; and
- Leads a programme of research on What Works in Tackling Poverty.

For further information please visit our website at www.ppiw.org.uk

Author Details

Dr Paul Sissons is a Senior Research Fellow in the Centre for Business in Society at Coventry University

Professor Anne Green is Professional Fellow at the Institute for Employment Research at the University of Warwick

Dr Neil Lee is Lecturer in Economic Geography at the Geography and Environment, London School of Economics and Political Science



This report is licensed under the terms of the Open Government Licence

